

# The Role of Spirituality in Irish Adult Education in culturally responsive teaching

ELIZABETH J TISDELL, PENN STATE UNIVERSITY, HARRISBURG

---

## Introduction

Spirituality, religion, and culture are complicated subjects. Indeed, they are fundamental socialising forces that affect how adult learners make meaning in the world. Adults bring these aspects of who they are with them to the learning environment, though often the spiritual/religious aspects of their development and learning story go unacknowledged by adult educators. But just as emotions clearly affect the learning process (Dirkx, 2006; McCormack, 2009), people's spirituality can deeply influence their learning as adults.

While there has been considerable discussion of the spiritual and religious dimensions of adult learning in North America (Dirkx, 1997; English and Gillen, 2000; English, 2007; Tisdell, 2003, 2007; Tolliver and Tisdell, 2006) and to some extent in England (Hunt, 2006; Jarvis and Walton, 1993), there's been little direct discussion of such dimensions in Irish adult education. This is interesting, given the history of religious conflict in Ireland as well as Ireland's increasing religious, spiritual, and cultural diversity due in part to the Celtic Tiger that has affected social inclusion issues in lifelong education efforts (Healy and Slowey, 2006). The new immigrants to Ireland, with their own unique religious and cultural histories (Fanning, 2007; Ryan and Fallon, 2005) have clearly affected the cultural landscape of Ireland. Thus, the purpose of this article is to examine why it is important for Irish adult educators to consider the spiritual, religious and cultural dimensions of adult learning, and to some extent, how to draw on it in practice. In so doing, I'll draw on my former research dealing with the intersection of spirituality and culture among US adult educators, and my initial research efforts into religion and spirituality in an Irish adult education context, as well as my own recent experience of Ireland while on sabbatical as a US adult education professor. First, it is important to outline what is meant by spirituality and religion, and how it relates to the current Irish landscape.

### **Spirituality and Religion in an Irish Context**

What is spirituality, and how is it different from religion? In general, spirituality focuses on an individual's experience of what they consider sacred; as one participant in my study put it, "spirituality is a journey toward wholeness." It is often connected to inspiration and transformation, in the sense of creating something new, often out of darkness, confusion or pain (London, 2007; Tolliver and Tisdell, 2006; Wuthnow, 1999). This is spirituality as an integration process that might engage one's soul while drawing on metaphor, art, poetry, symbol (Dirkx, 2001 Hunt, 2006). Religion, by contrast, is more about an organized community of faith, with an official creed, and codes of regulatory behavior, that have been determined by those with power in that religious institution. There are clearly positive and negative aspects of religious institutions. On the plus side, religions provide guidance on how to live a spiritual life, and ways of facilitating personal experiences of the sacred (Marty, 2000). They also provide community rituals, music, symbols, prayers, and sacred stories that honor many of life's transitions that serve as gateways to the sacred, that are also part of people's spiritual and cultural history (Inglis, 2005). These are the positive aspects of religion.

But there are also negative aspects to institutional religions just as there are to any human institution. There is ample evidence the world over religious institutions have at times oppressed individuals or entire social groups. Women as a group, for example, have been treated as second-class citizens by many religions. Another current example is the cover up of the sexual abuse scandal of Catholic priests and religious in both the US and in Ireland. Further, people throughout history into the present have been killed or maimed in the name of religion and politics; clearly Ireland is no stranger to this phenomenon. Yet, in spite of these more negative aspects, religions have offered people refuge, spiritual direction, and a sense of communal hope.

While there are distinctions between spirituality and religion, there are also places of overlap, particularly because most people were socialised in some religious tradition, which informs their spirituality, whether or not they continue to practice it. It is important to note here that it is more often because of the negative aspects of religion as human institutions that many people who grew up in some religious tradition no longer affiliate with it, either because they've simply drifted away, or because they are angry or have been hurt by some aspect of it. Nevertheless people continue to have some psychological

relationship with the religion in which they were socialized; further, religious identity often overlaps with political identity (Inglis, 2005). Hence, a complete emotional separation from one's childhood religion is impossible, as it has been formative to one's identity development. Due to the negative aspects of religion, many people, particularly in the US but perhaps in Ireland as well, now refer to themselves as "spiritual but not religious" (Wuthnow, 1999): they find a sense of spirituality important, but are leery of organized religion. Still, it is impossible to completely separate spirituality from religion. Many who define themselves as "spiritual but not religious" actually draw from a multitude of traditions to inform their spiritual practices and beliefs, from mindfulness meditation practices (that originated in Buddhism), to Yoga, to various meditation practices that might have their roots in Christianity, Sufism, or other contemporary spiritual movements that were once connected to more formal religions.

How does spirituality and religion in its many manifestations relate to the contemporary Irish context? Given the processes of globalization and worldwide migration, people everywhere are much more influenced than ever before by religious traditions and spiritual paths other than those in which they were socialized. Clearly the economy that fed the Celtic Tiger brought many new immigrants to the whole island of Ireland who brought new religions and cultures into the Catholic/Protestant landscape. The ways of these new immigrants have influenced contemporary Ireland's spiritual, religious, and cultural milieu as much as the scandals of the Catholic Church and the dissolution (still in process) of "the Troubles" have affected it. These multiple influences in the Irish landscape might add to why those in Ireland who do identify with the religion of their parents are less rigidly defined by it, and take what Inglis (2007) refers to as a "smorgasbord approach" (p. 205) to it, as many Catholics have done. They draw from it what is useful, and leave behind what is not.

The rise of the Celtic Tiger might have also facilitated the fascination in the past decade with all things Celtic by many people around the world, including "Celtic spirituality", and all its "Celtic threads", as folklorist Padraigin Clancy (1999) says. Tourists of Irish descent from North America and other parts of the world return to Ireland in search of their roots, including their Celtic spiritual roots, and travel to places like Newgrange, Glendolough, and Bridgid's Well, as part of re-claiming the Celtic threads of spirituality, sometimes as a spiritual pilgrimage. (To some extent, and being of Irish and Catholic descent I have been one of those "tourists".) This fascination with things Celtic may be more

common to those whose ancestors emigrated from Ireland and serve as a boon to the tourism industry (Kneafsey 2002); nevertheless, this Celtic re-claiming among “spiritual tourists” is another influence in the religious and spiritual cultural milieu of Ireland. The multiple religious and spiritual influences in the Irish cultural landscape have not been discussed in the Irish adult education literature; yet the proceedings from the recent conference on “Alternative Spiritualities, the New Age, and New Religious Movements in Ireland” held at NUI Maynooth in October of 2009 (Cosgrove and Cox, 2009), indicate that they are being discussed in other disciplines. It is time for Irish adult education to consider what these contemporary influences of religion and spirituality in an increasingly culturally diverse Ireland might suggest for Irish adult education. In what follows I attempt to do so by drawing on my former research on spirituality and culture in the US, and my beginning research study in an Irish context, as a midlife US adult education professor trying to make further meaning of my own life by drawing on my own passions and interests.

#### **Studying spirituality: Interconnections of my background, former spirituality research, and teaching**

The subjects of religion and spirituality have always fascinated me. I grew up Roman Catholic in a middle class family in a suburb of Boston, Massachusetts in the US. I am of Irish descent; my great grandparents emigrated from Killarney, and perhaps like many in Ireland, a large piece of my childhood memories are related to the Catholic Church and its adjacent elementary school I attended. I have a master’s degree in religion, and after working for 10 years doing pastoral work in university settings with adult learners, I eventually left the official ministry world behind, and completed my doctorate in adult education in 1992; I have worked as a professor ever since.

In my early years as a professor, much of my teaching and research focused on emancipatory education efforts, drawing on the insights of Brazilian activist and educator Paulo Freire (1971), black feminist cultural critic, bell hooks (1994), and numerous critical multicultural education and feminist scholars. I was teaching in relatively culturally diverse settings, attempting to challenge oppressive systems. But I was motivated to do so because of my own spiritual commitments; I knew other adult educators were as well but few people spoke about it. Thus, in the late 1990s, I began a study of how spirituality informed the work of emancipatory educators, which resulted in numerous publications over the years since 2000.

#### **The study’s findings**

My purpose here is not to discuss the details of the study, as they’ve been discussed elsewhere (Tisdell, 2000, 2003, 2007); nevertheless a brief synopsis is useful here. The purpose of that qualitative study was to explore how spirituality informs the work of a multicultural group of higher and adult educators who were specifically teaching classes that attempted to challenge systems of oppression based on race, culture, gender, and sexual orientation in either higher education or community settings. The 31 participants included 22 women and 9 men; 17 people of color (6 African-American, 4 Latino, 4 Asian-American, 2 Native American, 1 of East Indian descent) and 14 white Euro-Americans. The interviews focused on participants’ individual spiritual journeys, how their spirituality relates to their cultural identity, the sharing of three significant spiritual experiences or, and how spirituality informs their education efforts.

Participants highlighted the role of spirituality both as it informs their teaching and in their own lives in: (1) dealing with internalized oppression and re-claiming cultural identity; (2) mediating among multiple identities (race, gender, class, sexuality); (3) crossing culture to facilitate spiritual and overall development of a more authentic identity; and (4) unconscious knowledge-construction processes that are connected to image, symbol, ritual, and metaphor that are often cultural. While nearly all were socialised in a religious tradition, of the 31, only 6 still associated strongly with their childhood religious traditions; the rest tended to self-define as “spiritual but not religious.” All, however, continually spiraled back and reclaimed images, symbols, and music that still had important meaning from their childhood religious, family, and cultural traditions. This connection to meaning associated with such expression is why one never completely emotionally separates from one’s childhood religious tradition, and is why spirituality, culture, and religion often overlap: one’s religious background is intermeshed with culture and identity.

#### **A Theory and Practice of Culturally Responsive Teaching**

The study and its findings as well as my experience of teaching in a diverse context have continued to inform both my attempts at culturally responsive teaching and theorizing about it. I have taught in multiple contexts over the years, both in the community and in higher education, though the majority of my work is as a professor teaching graduate classes, including those that focus on diversity and cultural inclusion issues. Geneva Gay (2000) suggests “culturally responsive education recognizes, respects, and uses students’ identities and

backgrounds as meaningful sources for creating optimal learning environments” (p. 3). Educators create such environments by including readings by and about members of diverse cultural communities, drawing on learners’ own experiences, and making use of various teaching strategies that engage multiple aspects of who they are. Latino writer David Abalos (1998) talks about the importance of freeing the “sacred face” in his ideas on transformative teaching for social change. He argues that for social transformation to occur, both individuals and cultural groups need to explore how the mechanisms imposed by cultural hegemony and colonialism have affected multiple aspects of their identity, and to reclaim these aspects of their identity on their own terms. In the process, he suggests they often re-claim and make sacred, ways of knowing grounded in their own culture; indeed these might be expressed through music, art, poetry, or drama, which engages their creativity. This is part of what Abalos means by “freeing the sacred face,” a notion that begins to theoretically give insight to the role of spirituality in emancipatory education. Here I offer a brief example of what this looks like in my own practice.

I currently work with adult learners in graduate higher education settings. Much of our work is about understanding theory and its relationship to educational practice, and is thus quite rationally driven. Yet often I provide a venue as a synthesizing activity to bring in ways of knowing that engage image, symbol, metaphor, art, or drama as it allows participants to give cultural expression to their own forms of knowledge. Many find these types of activities freeing; some even find them inspiring. Some learners connect this process of engaging with image and symbol as part of dealing with their internalized oppression and taking action on their own behalf as a spiritual process. Others don’t map to it that way. Engagement with symbol seems particularly important to women (and some men), and to people of color, and many will bring or create a symbol that speaks to or references their gender or culture as part of re-claiming power.

Based on the literature, the findings of the study, and my own experience of teaching, elements of a spiritually grounded and culturally responsive model of transformative education emphasize the following: (1) the authenticity of teachers and learners; (2) an environment that allows for the exploration of the cognitive (through readings and discussion of ideas), the affective and relational (through connection with other people and of ideas to life experience), and the symbolic (through art form—poetry, art, music, drama); (3) readings that reflect the cultures of the members of the class and the cultural pluralism of the

geographical area relevant to the course content; (4) collaborative work that envisions and presents manifestations of multiple dimensions of learning and strategies for change; (5) A creative synthesizing activity that presents what has been learned in a different medium; (6) recognition of the limitations of any adult education environment and that transformation is an ongoing process that takes time. While space limitations don’t allow for detailed discussion of each of these elements, the model does not require that either the teacher or learner necessarily discuss or use the term “spirituality”. Nor is the intent for learners to necessarily have a “spiritual experience” in the learning activity; rather teaching in such a way creates space for learners to express and discover what connects to their culture which may also connect to their religion, and to their spirituality. But whether learners define this as “spiritual” is up to them.

Would drawing on such a model work in an Irish context? It would be up to readers to determine this, as Ireland is not my cultural teaching context. But after an autoethnographic discussion of my experience in Ireland and its spiritual and religious traditions during my sabbatical and attempt at similar research, I’ll attempt to provide some sort of direction here.

#### **Researching spirituality, religion, and culture in Ireland in the formal and informal context**

I wanted to spend my sabbatical doing a similar research study in Ireland of how Irish adult educators deal with diversity and how spirituality and religion might inform their efforts at doing so because of Ireland’s increased religious and cultural diversity. But I was approaching my sabbatical, not only as a research journey, but also as a spiritual pilgrimage of sorts, though I was somewhat ambivalent about leaving in light of my 89 year-old father’s frail health. I visited him, before I left, and did so with his blessing, and an “Our Father” – the Lord’s Prayer for the journey. I thought of Neil Douglas-Klotz’s (1990) midrash on the Aramaic words of the first two lines, Abwoon D’bwashamaya Netqaddash shmak (p. 10) who suggests Netquaddah shmak (translated as “hallowed by they name”), is equivalent to being hollowed out so that one’s inner light (schem) can shine more brightly. I was hoping I would be hollowed out.

### A spiritual pilgrimage of sorts

I arrived in County Mayo, and met up with two American friends, and was to begin my Irish pilgrimage journey by joining them and thousands of people who climb Croagh Patrick on Reek Sunday each year. We had decided to join a group of about fifty doing the 22-mile pilgrimage from Ballintubber Abbey. It was the hardest physical thing I've ever done! I had never walked 22 miles before on a road, much less through fields, and water, and bogs, and rivers, and then to climb up and down a mountain. To provide some auto-ethnographic data and context, below is an excerpt from an e-mail I sent to friends and family back in the US when we completed the journey.

We met at Ballintubber Abbey. Fr. Frank Fahey, who oversees the Abbey, gave an introduction to the pilgrimage. A delightful man, I liked the fact that he didn't trash the Druids and pagan people that lived there before Patrick. While I have great respect for St. Patrick who was the patron saint of my Irish ancestors, I'm not sure that I like the fact that Patrick likely tried to do away with the Druid, pagan, and earth-based (and maybe feminist) traditions of those that predated Christianity and were here first. While I don't know the details of this history, there are always stories of power and privilege that don't get told since history is written by the winners. I was interested to find out that the Celtic Cross is a mixture of the circles of the sun with the Christian cross going through it. I like this image, as long as the cross isn't meant to obliterate the circles of the Druid/pagan's sun!!

Fr. Fahey talked of the journey of St. Patrick, in light of the journey of pilgrims. He did explain some of the rules of the journey of the pilgrims "No complain-in" he said, and "when you step in cow pies, you simply exclaim, '*T'anks be to God!*'" I ended up saying, "*T'anks be to God!*" many times through the 22 mile journey, after falling and cutting my hand, through the wind and the rain, and the sopping wetness! He said that people sometimes do the pilgrimage for someone, and/or to do penance. So many people lit a candle at the beginning; I lit a candle for my dad and dedicated the journey to him, in hopes that these final days of his life can be filled with light, schem.

As I began the walk, I imagined my great grandparents, perhaps walking this path, perhaps before they went off to America. Perhaps their parents before them walked this pilgrimage. I thought of those who came before them, and those even before them, wondering if the cells of my body knew this journey.

The road was rough. There were bogs, and water, and there was tremendous wind, and many cow and sheep "pies" that I tried to dodge, but nevertheless walked through. As I walked, I meditated a lot on the Our Father in Aramaic. *Abwoon D'bashamaya Netqaddash shmak* -- especially the *Netqaddash shmak* part, about being hollowed out so that light (or "schem") can shine. I thought LOTS about how my life has been so cluttered and full of stuff, an endless to-do list of so many things in academia that I don't really care about. I hoped and prayed that as a result of this journey I could be hollowed out so that the light inside of me can shine, with good things, rather than endless reactions to just what is happening and what I seem to think I have to do. So may this journey and this sabbatical time hollow me out and hallow me out.

At many of the particularly difficult intervals, I meditated on various poems I knew and said various prayers from childhood to adulthood that I remembered, and used centering techniques I had learned in Zen meditation. I was using everything I could think of to try to help me both meditate on the journey, and allow me to finish: anything to get me through! When the going got really tough, I meditated on the mysteries of the Rosary to keep my mind occupied. I found this surprising at first, but these earliest vestiges of my spiritual development and of what I was taught in Catholic grade school nearly 50 years ago are sometimes very handy in a time like this!! I was so miserable I thought the Sorrowful Mysteries the most appropriate, reframed for these circumstances. Instead of beginning with "The Agony in the Garden", I could reflect on "The Agony in the Bog on the Way to the Mountain". Then when I fell and cut my hand on a rock, I was reminded of the fourth Sorrowful Mystery, "the Carrying of the Cross", and the stations of the cross that I did as a little girl, when Jesus falls – I think 3 times, but I can't remember for sure. Anyway, I only fell once. But the rosaries did keep my mind focused for a time on something besides my misery. I developed a terrible blister on the sole of my foot. But the back of my legs and my lower back hurt so much that the blister was just another thing no more miserable than anything else. ("*T'anks be to God!*")

When we finally got to the ridge of Croagh Patrick, seeing above and down to the sea was glorious, even though where we were there was tremendous wind, and rain, there was sun shining on the sea below. It was magnificent in its beauty. Just Magnificent. It would've given new meaning to the Glorious Mysteries of the Rosary – but at this point, while I could enjoy the view, I was more into my Zen-Buddhist phase of both being in the moment, and thinking of every-

thing I could remember about Tai Chi, and breathing into the hara just to stay grounded, and not to fall off the mountain! I was exhausted, and not sure I could make it down this very rocky, slippery, steep terrain in one piece. So for the rest of the journey, I didn't think of complaining about my sore back, legs, wind-burned face, or very wet body, or blister on my foot, or the cut in my hand (*"T'anks be to God!"*). I could only think of doing my Tai Chi breathing into my lower belly, staying grounded, and going slow and steady!! Indeed, I made it!!! And I am somewhat hollowed out. (*"T'anks be to God!"*). *Netqaddash shmak*. I'm hoping my shem, my light, shines a little brighter. And that maybe my dad's journey at these closing days will bring him a greater sense of *shem*, Light. *Netqaddash shmak!*

I included this autoethnographic excerpt at some length written only days after the journey, not only because some readers probably have done it, and clearly most in Ireland will know of it. But the excerpt provides an example of how all phases of spiritual development are with us at all times; many of us rely on that sense of spirituality to guide us in our life's journey throughout our adulthood, though the difficulties as well as through the good times. In my own story of Croagh Patrick we see how my Christianity and Catholicism intersect with my appreciation of the Druid and earth-based spiritualities, my foray into Zen meditation and Tai Chi, as well as my appreciation of the insights of Sufi mystics. All of these influences are a part of my spiritual development, and to some extent are with me all the time including when I prepare and teach my classes, just as they are with the adult learners in them. I might not consciously think of these spiritual threads as much as I did during the pilgrimage itself; after all the purpose of pilgrimage is to focus on these things. Nevertheless, what bubbled up on the journey is what grounds me and gives meaning to my life. It's these same touchstones that guided me through my father's dying process, when I was called home from my sabbatical in September due to his further health decline. With failing memory in those last weeks, he expressed a wide range of emotions. But he still always remembered his children's names, and his Catholic prayers and the mysteries of the Rosary; he would sometimes give an unexpected kiss on the hand. I wrote the following about three weeks before he died, about the important lessons I was learning as I fed him some yoghurt:

It was strange, for someone who is into wanting to be productive and at times feels sorry for myself about the untimely end to my sabbatical in Ireland, I did have the sense as I fed my father a spoonful of yoghurt, that this was among the

most important work I would ever do. A spoonful of yoghurt, an unexpected kiss on the hand, and a lesson in the significance of saying prayers at the end of one's life that has been part of the fabric of one's living breathing, and earliest memory. These are simple, but profound lessons. It's still not easy, I have to say. And as the mystery of the light fades as the sun shifts to its autumn horizon, and as I watched the beautiful orange-pinkish-green leaves of the maple tree outside my father's New Hampshire window glitter in that changing light, I thought of the importance of grabbing the mystery of that light as it shifts and changes inside my own soul. I even donned an old sweatshirt in pinkish orange with a dash of green in honor of the luminous leaves glittering in that autumn sun, and to honor that special moment. It does help, and is quite mysterious; but I'm still trying hard not to be depressed in spite of the wonder of the mystery in it all. In these times, it is great to trust that Mystery will appear, and this time, it was in all her autumnal glory!

While I didn't want my time in Ireland to be cut short, I learned some more important life lessons than what I had planned; it was a different sort of adult learning experience than what I expected on my sabbatical. I heard and saw my dad express some similar spiritual touchstones during his journey toward death that I also experienced on the journey to Croagh Patrick, though his were more identifiably and more exclusively Catholic. Those experiences both in Ireland and with my dad made me think of my own life and my spirituality in a deeper way. Life does that, as we make further meaning of its new events and new places, and it also does so in the lives of our adult learners as well. While they might not climb Croagh Patrick, they have touchstones and grounding places from their own cultural context that are part of their own spiritual journey which guides how they make meaning in the world. This is why it needs to be taken account as part of culturally responsive education.

### **Musings on formal research interrupted**

I did manage to begin the formal part of my research study on the role of spirituality in culturally responsive education in Ireland in mid August, but was only able to conduct two formal interviews before I returned to the US to tend to my dad. However, I did have several informal conversations with those who teach adults either in higher education or in community settings while I was traveling around seeing the sights of Ireland and visiting friends. Both from my interviews and informal conversations, I recognize that the cultural context around issues of spirituality is somewhat different in Ireland than it is in the US. While

clearly a sense of personal spirituality was important to many I spoke with, those in academia seemed to indicate that spirituality was often equated with religion in the whole of Ireland. Because of the history of religious conflict there was great hesitation about discussing anything that might relate to religion (including spirituality) in any kind of public setting. In trying to get a handle on understanding this, in an e-mail exchange, an Irish colleague explained:

Generally it is not considered 'with it' among European academics to discuss spirituality unless one is actually in a theology college. When I studied [academic discipline] we did everything but a spirituality perspective... seems crazy. It is deemed -in general- that you are slightly off the wall if God is mentioned. The same goes for our politicians. In USA it is evidently very different...! Never happens here.

Perhaps it doesn't happen in Ireland as much as in the US, but it is indeed beginning to happen. As noted earlier, there was a whole conference on "Alternative Spiritualities, the New Age, and New Religious Movements in Ireland" last October of 2009 (Cosgrove and Cox, 2009), so it is being considered in other academic arenas, and among socio-cultural workers. Most of the presenters were people who work in academia or in community settings, who are recognizing that the New Immigrants along with other socio-cultural influences, are having an impact on both spirituality and religion in Ireland. Ireland is not just Catholic or Protestant anymore; it is Muslim, Jewish, pagan, Buddhist, New Age, and much more, including people with a blended spirituality. It is important in working with people of different cultural groups, to honor the ways they make meaning in light of their intersecting cultural, spiritual, and religious histories.

### Conclusions

Is it possible to draw on spirituality in culturally responsive education in some of the ways that I discussed earlier in light of my always-developing theory of a spiritually grounded cultural responsive model of transformative adult education I discussed above? I think it is possible with some caveats. While I don't necessarily use the term "spirituality" or discuss it when I'm teaching (unless that's what the course is about), I do create space where learners can draw on image and symbol, and share cultural stories that sometimes do bring up spirituality. Of course, in the US, there is not the history of religious conflict that exists in Ireland. But I do think Irish adult educators can easily create space where the ways people make spiritual meaning can be brought into the learn-

ing environment. It appears that many Irish adult educators are drawing on some of the same teaching technologies that I do, where space is created potentially to do so. Indeed, many Irish educators have talked about and made use of drawing on emotion, the arts, metaphor, symbol, and image, and multiple ways of knowing in adult learning settings (McCormack, 2009). There's also been much discussion of cultural inclusion and equality issues for new immigrants to Ireland, and Ryan and Fallon (2005), in their discussion of citizen education, specifically discuss the importance of creating space for learners to be "in one's world and of one's world". Creating space where learners can draw on their own forms of cultural expression, just might connect to their spirituality; it might be part of "claiming a sacred face" that is "in and of their world." Perhaps it can add dimension to how Irish adult educators can continue to develop a more culturally responsive approach to education.

### References:

- Clancy, P. (Ed.) (1999). *Celtic threads: Exploring the wisdom of our heritage*. Dublin, Ireland: Veritas.
- Dirkx, J. (1997). *Nurturing soul in adult learning*. New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Dirkx, J. (2006). *Engaging emotions in adult learning: Jungian perspectives on emotion and transformational learning*. New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, 109, 15-26.
- Douglas-Klotz, N. (1990). *Prayers of the cosmos: Meditations on the Aramaic words of Jesus*. San Francisco: Harper.
- English, L. M. (2005a). *Historical and contemporary explorations of the social change and spiritual directions of adult education*. Teachers College Record, 107(6), 1169-1192.
- English, L. M., and Gillen, M. A. (Eds.). (2000). *Addressing the spiritual dimensions of adult learning: What educators can do*. New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, No. 85. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Fanning, B. (Ed.) (2007). *Immigration and social change in the Republic of Ireland*. Manchester, England: Manchester University Press.
- Gay, Geneva. (2000). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice*. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Healy, T. and Slowey, M. (2006). *Social exclusion and adult engagement in Lifelong Learning — some comparative implications for European states based on Ireland's Celtic Tiger experience*. Compare: British Association for International and Comparative Education, 36 (3), 359-378.
- Inglis, T. (2005). *Religion, identity, state, and society*. In Cleary, J., and Connolly, C. (eds.), *The Cambridge companion to Modern Irish Culture* (pp. 59-77) Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.

- Inglis, T. (2007). *Catholic Identity in Contemporary Ireland: Belief and Belonging to Tradition*. *Journal of Contemporary Religion*, 22 (2). 205-220.
- Hunt, C. (2006). *Travels with a turtle: Metaphors and the making of a professional identity*. *Reflective Practice*, 7(3), 315-332.
- Jarvis, P. and Walton, N. (eds) (1993). *Adult education and theological interpretations*. Malabar, FL: Krieger.
- Kneafsey, Moya (2002). *Tourism images and the construction of celticity in Ireland and Brittany*. In D. Harvey, R. Jones, N. McInroy, and C. Milligan (eds.) *Celtic geographies: old culture, new times*. London: Routledge.
- London, P. (2007). *Concerning the spiritual in art education*. In L. Bresler (Ed.) *International Handbook of Research in Arts Education* (pp. 1405–1422). Dordecht, The Netherlands: Springer.
- McCormack, D. (2009). *'A Parcel of Knowledge': An Autoethnographic Exploration of the Emotional Dimension of Teaching and Learning in Adult Education*. *The Adult Learner* 2009. Dublin: Aontas
- Power, Rosemary (2006). *A place of community: "Celtic" Iona and institutional religion*. *Folklore*, 117, 33-53.
- Ryan, A.B. (1999). *Sources for a politicised practice of women's personal development education*. In B. Connolly and A.B. Ryan (Eds.), *Women and education in Ireland*, Volume 2. Maynooth: MACE
- Ryan, A., and Fallon, H. (2005). *Citizenship education: A way of being in one's world and of one's world*. *The Adult Learner* 2005. Dublin: Aontas
- Tisdell, E. J. (2003). *Exploring spirituality and culture in adult and higher education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Tisdell, E. J. (2007). *In the new millennium: The role of spirituality and the cultural imagination in dealing with diversity and equity in the higher education classroom*. *Teachers College Record*, 109(3), 531–560.
- Tisdell, E. and Tolliver E. (2003). *Claiming a sacred face: The role of spirituality and cultural identity in transformative adult higher education*. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 1(4). 368-392.
- Wuthnow, R. (1999). *Growing up religious*. Boston: Beacon Press.